

# Refutation

<b>Lesson Title</b>	All we need are 4 steps
<b>Grade Level</b>	5-8
<b>Overview</b>	What is refutation and how can I be great at it? To dispute an argument effectively, refutation must be mastered.
<b>Materials/Resources</b>	4 step method poster (large for all to see) <b>They say...</b> <b>But I disagree...</b> <b>Because...</b> <b>Therefore...</b> Refutation worksheet (definition) one per student I Disagree worksheet-one per student
<b>Objective</b>	SWBAT refute the argument using the 4 step method (knock down the argument)
<b>Background Information</b>	4 steps 1. refute the argument 2. provide counter-assertion 3. offer reason to complete your argument 4. draw a conclusion and explain why your argument trumps other Clash is fundamental principle of good debate.
<b>Anticipatory Set</b>	State assertions that will get kids jumping out of seats to argue. Model ARE for each. <u>School should be year round</u> because students forget so much over the summer. Teachers and students spend at least one month reviewing what was learned last year. <u>Students should have 3 hours of homework every day.</u> Doing work at home would help the class move faster. Teachers could accomplish more and students would be smarter. <u>Driving age should be 21</u> because so many kids get in accidents. People are adults at 21 and can be more responsible. You should see hands up, ready to offer reasons why not.

created by Dee Burek      Garden State Debate League President  
 Debate Teacher at Stone Bridge Middle School      Allentown NJ  
[deeburek@gmail.com](mailto:deeburek@gmail.com)

# Refutation

<p><b>Procedure</b></p>	<p>Yesterday, we learned the parts of an argument. What were they? (ARE) So do we live our lives letting people just make assertions? What do you do when you disagree with someone? Stomp your foot? Yell? Cry? What works? How do you win arguments? (Show your side is better)</p> <p>Explain how to refute argument. Take one from above and use steps.</p> <p>Use the key words to signify 4 steps.</p> <p><b>They say:</b> restate argument in 7 words or less</p> <p><b>but I disagree:</b> state counter argument (opposite of opponent)</p> <p><b>because:</b> offer reason for your argument</p> <p><b>therefore:</b> show your argument is better</p> <p>Model kid friendly argument using ARE and then refute it with 4 step key words.</p> <p>"Cell phones should be allowed in school because kids need to call their parents in case there is an emergency. When an emergency happens, kids could call the police."</p> <p>"They say that cell phones could be used to call parents in emergencies, but I disagree because the kids would not have time to call parents. Students would need to listen to teachers in emergencies. Teachers would need to give instructions and have the kids listen. Cell phones would be distracting in an emergency and during the day. Students would be using phones and could cause many problems during the day. Therefore, cell phones would distract learning and possibly cause more confusion in an emergency."</p> <p>Students try it out. They can give you argument and you refute it. Then have them refute some. Guide them step-by-step.</p> <p>"Sometimes, we can't disagree with the argument. Cigarettes should be banned because they cause cancer." So we need to 1st agree and then knock it down.</p>
-------------------------	--

created by Dee Burek      Garden State Debate League President  
 Debate Teacher at Stone Bridge Middle School      Allentown NJ  
[deeburek@gmail.com](mailto:deeburek@gmail.com)

# Refutation

	<p>"They say that cigarettes should be banned because they cause cancer. While that may be true, there are many reasons that people get cancer. Not only from cigarettes. Many people smoke their whole life and never get cancer. On the other hand, cigarette companies hire lots of workers. If we ban cigarettes, production will stop and those people will be out of work. If people lose their job, their families will suffer. Therefore, cigarettes should not be banned." This is much harder to do for kids.</p>
<b>Check for Understanding</b>	<p>Model kid friendly argument using ARE and then refute it with 4 step key words. Have kids stand or put thumbs up when they hear steps. Close eyes and picture the poster with words. Turn to person and recite.</p>
<p><b>Guided Practice</b></p> <p><b>Assessment:</b>As you circulate, listen for key words from students. Use a 4 column checklist. Next to each student's name, place a check mark if you heard them use steps.</p>	<p>Students work in pairs using assertions from yesterday. Read assertion, use ARE and 4 step refutation to knock down argument. Take turns. Partner can help with ARE or 4 step refutation. Use key words. <b><i>They say, but I disagree, because, therefore</i></b> Class should be noisy and engaged. Circulate to assist students with reasons, evidence, or refutation. Be sure you hear key words. Switch partners if needed. Pair 3 kids if needed to help guide them.</p>
<b>Closure</b>	<p>Now you have the two parts needed to win arguments. What are key words to remember? Assertion, reasoning, evidence and they say, but I disagree, because, therefore. Use them daily. At lunch, throw out an idea and see if you can use them to win the argument. Use them with your parents and siblings.</p>
<b>Independent Practice</b>	<p>I Disagree worksheet Each argument needs 4 steps to be complete. Collect and score out of 12 possible.</p>
<b>Additional assessments</b>	<p>Watch debates on C-SPAN look for 4 steps. Practice ARE with friends, siblings, and parents.</p>
<b>Notes:</b>	

created by Dee Burek      Garden State Debate League President  
 Debate Teacher at Stone Bridge Middle School      Allentown NJ  
[deeburek@gmail.com](mailto:deeburek@gmail.com)

# Refutation

<b>Common Core Standards:</b>	College and Career Readiness <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.SL.1</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.SL.3</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.SL.4</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.SL.6</a></li></ul> Speaking and Listening <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.1</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.2</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.3</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.4</a></li><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.6</a></li></ul> Writing <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <a href="#">CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.8.1</a></li></ul>